

専門用語にみる“Critical”の意味の分類と考察 CDA との比較を通して

西原貴之（呉工業高等専門学校）

キーワード：クリティカル，CDA，応用言語学

1. 本発表の目的

- (1) 応用言語学（狭義の意味）で用いられている“critical”という語を含んだ専門用語を事典から拾い集め、それらの用語を分類・記述すること。
- (2) (1)の結果を、CDAでの“critical”の用法と比較し、応用言語学におけるクリティカルアプローチの今後の課題を見出すこと。

2. “critical”の意味

- (1) 語源
kitos : a judge (Williams, 1995)、krino : to decide (Adorno, 1998)
- (2) 一般的な意味 (*Longman Dictionary of Contemporary English* (3rd edition)より)
 - a. MAKING SEVERE JUDGEMENT、b. IMPORTANT、c. DANGEROUS/UNCERTAIN、
 - d. MAKING FAIR JUDGEMENT、e. produced by or resulting from the work of CRITICS
- (3) CDAでの“critical”の意味
Reisigl & Wodak (2001)
Text or discourse immanent critique / Sociodiagnostic critique / Socio-pragmatic critique

3. 応用言語学の“critical”という語を含む専門用語

- (1) 参照書物
D1 : Richards, et al (1985) / D2 : Richards, et al (1992) / D3 : Richards & Schmidt (2002) / E1 : Johnson & Johoson (Ed.) (1998) / E2 : Byram (Ed.) (2001) / E3 : Kaplan (Ed.) (2002) / E4 : Davis & Elder (Eds.) (2004) / E5 : Hinkel (Ed.) (2005)
- (2) 方法
Dictionary という名が付いているものはその項目を、Encyclopedia や Handbook という名が付いている書物は項目と索引に載っているものを抽出し、その意味ごとに分類した（関連分野として紹介されているものは、今回は分析対象外）。その結果は付録が示す通りである。
- (3) 応用言語学における“critical”の意味 (Pennycook (2004)も参考にしながら分類)
対外：関連分野の名前であり今回は分類対象外 / A : IMPORTANT / B : 得た情報を自分の知識の観点から評価する / C : ある対象に対する他の観点を評価する / D : 応用言語学の概念を社会や文化、政治などに関係づける / E : Dだけでなく、更に社会的な問題を同定する / F : DやEに加えて、常に懐疑的な態度を取り続ける

4. 考察

- (1) Critical Linguistics と CDA が登場して以来、社会や政治的な観点に応用言語学の概念を関連付ける新たな概念が多く作り出されてきている。そして、それらは CDA の socio-pragmatic critique とかなり密接な関係を持った概念である。
- (2) CDA の immanent critique と sociodiagnostic critique に特化したような概念はあまり生み出されていない。
- (3) 懐疑し続けた結果をどのように用い、どのように実際の社会変化を引き起こすかといった点についての専門用語を欠いている（これはCDAにも言える問題である）。

5. 本発表の限界

専門用語の定義からのみの考察である点（専門用語が実際にどのようにディスコースの中で用いられているかを見ていない点）。

6. 引用文献（調査に用いた事典などについては紙面の都合上、割愛）

Adorno, T. W. (1998). *Critical models: Interventions and catchwords*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Pennycook, A. (2004). Critical Applied Linguistics. In A. Davies & C. Elder (Eds.), *The handbook of applied linguistics* (pp. 787-804). Oxford: Blackwell.

Reisigl, M., & Wodak, R. (2001). *Discourse and discrimination: Rhetorics of racism and anti-Semitism*. London: Routledge.

Williams, R. (1976). *Keywords: A vocabulary of culture and society*. London: Fontana.

付録

専門用語	意味	D1	D2	D3	E1	E2	E3	E4	E5
Critical age	A	-	-	+	-	-	-	-	+
Critical Applied Linguistics	F	-	-	+	-	-	-	+	-
Critical Approach to Language Planning	E	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-
Critical Approach to LSP Teaching	E	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-
Critical Approach to Translation	E	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-
Critical Bilingualism	E	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-
Critical comprehension	B	+	+	+	-	-	-	-	-
Critical Discourse Analysis	対外	-	-	+	-	+	+	+	+
Critical English for Academic Purposes	E	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-
Critical Ethnography	対外	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	+
Critical Genre Studies	対外	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-
Critical Incident	C	-	-	-	-	+	-	-	-
Critical language awareness	E	-	-	-	-	-	+	+	-
Critical Language Socialization	D	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	+
Critical Language Testing	E	-	-	-	-	-	+	+	-
Critical Linguistics	対外	-	-	+	+	-	-	+	-
Critical (Academic) Literacy	E	-	-	+	-	-	-	-	+
Critical needs analysis	E	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-
Critical Pedagogy	対外	-	-	+	-	-	+	+	+
Critical period	A	-	-	+	-	-	-	-	-
Critical period hypothesis	A	+	+	+	+	-	+	+	+
Critical reading (newer sense)	D	-	+	+	+	-	-	+	-
Critical reading (older sense)	B	-	+	+	+	-	-	+	-
Critical Sociolinguistics	対外	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-
Critical Sociology	対外	-	-	-	-	-	-	+	-
Critical Theory	対外	-	-	+	-	-	-	+	-
Critical thinking	B	-	-	+	-	-	-	+	-

謝辞

本発表の内容に関して、ランカスター大学の Ruth Wodak 教授には有益な示唆と丁寧なご指導を賜った。ここに御礼を申し上げたい。

専門用語にみる“Critical”の意味の分類と考察
CDA との比較を通して

西原貴之（呉工業高等専門学校）

キーワード：クリティカル，CDA，応用言語学

【分析対象の文献】

- [D1] : Richards, J., Platt, J. and Weber, H. (1985). *Longman dictionary of applied linguistics*. Essex, England: Longman.
- [D2] : Richards, J. C., Platt, J. and Platt, H. (1992). *Longman dictionary of language teaching and applied linguistics* (2nd edn.). Essex, England: Longman.
- [D3] : Richards, J. C. and Schmidt, R. (2002). *Longman dictionary of language teaching & applied linguistics* (3rd edn.). London: Longman.
- [E1] : Johnson, K. and Johnson, H. (eds.) (1998). *Encyclopedic dictionary of applied linguistics: a handbook for language teaching*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- [E2] : Byram, M. (ed.) (2001). *The Routledge encyclopedia of language teaching and learning*. London: Routledge.
- [E3] : Kaplan, R. B. (ed.) (2002). *The Oxford handbook of applied linguistics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- [E4] : Davies, A. and Elder, C. (eds.) (2004). *The handbook of applied linguistics*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- [E5] : Hinkel, E. (ed.) (2005). *Handbook of research in second language teaching and learning*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

【その他、参考文献】

- Benesch, S. (1996). Needs analysis and curriculum design in EAP: An example of a critical approach. *TESOL Quarterly* 30: 723-38.
- Benesch, S. (2001). *Critical English for academic purposes: theory, politics and practice*. Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum Associates Associates.
- Bourdieu, P. (1991). *Language and symbolic power*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Brumfit, C. (1997). How applied linguistics is the same as any other science. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics* 7: 86-94.
- Busturkmen, H., & Elder, C. (2005). The practice of LSP. In Davies, A. and Elder, C. (eds.) *The handbook of applied linguistics*. Oxford: Blackwell, pp. 672-94.
- Canagarajah, S. (2005). Critical pedagogy in L2 learning and teaching. In Hinkel, E. (ed.) (2005). *Handbook of research in second language teaching and learning*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, pp. 931-49.
- Candlin, C. (1990). What happens when applied linguistics goes critical? In Halliday, M. A. K., Gibbons, J. and Nicholas, H. (eds.) *Learning, keeping and using language*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, pp. 461-86.
- Dant, T. (2003). *Critical social theory: culture, sociology and critique*. London: Sage.
- Davies, A. (1999). *An introduction to applied linguistics: from practice to theory*. Edinburgh, Scotland: Edinburgh University Press.
- Davies, A. (2005). *A glossary of applied linguistics*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Fairclough, N. (1989). *Language and power*. London: Longman.
- Fairclough, N. (1992). *Discourse and social change*. Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Fairclough, N. (1996). A reply to Henry Widdowson's "Discourse analysis: a critical view". *Language and Literature* 5: 49-56.

- Freire, P. (1996). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (2nd edn.). London: Penguin.
- Gadsby, A. (ed.) (1995). *Longman dictionary of contemporary English* (3rd edn.). London: Longman.
- Hatim, B. and Mason, I. (1997). *The translator as communicator*. London: Routledge.
- Held, D. (1980). *Introduction to critical theory: Horkheimer to Habermas*. London: Hutchinson.
- Hornby, A. S. (ed.) (2000). *Oxford advanced learner's dictionary of current English* (6th edn.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hyland, K. (2002). Genre: language, context and literacy. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics* 22: 113-35.
- Hyon, S. (1996). Genre in three traditions: implications for ESL. *TESOL Quarterly* 30: 693-722.
- Kincheloe, J. L. and McLaren, P. (2000). Rethinking critical theory and qualitative research. In Denzin, N. K. and Lincoln, Y. S. (eds.) *The handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, pp. 279-313.
- Kramsch, C. and Lam, W. S. E. (1999). Textual identities: the importance of being non-native. In Braine, G. (ed.) *Non-native educators in English language teaching*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, pp. 57-72.
- Lenneberg, E. H. (1967). *Biological foundations of language*. New York: Wiley.
- Maingueneau, D. (2006). Is discourse analysis critical? and this risky order of discourse. *Critical Discourse Studies* 3: 229-35.
- Mercure, H. (1968). *Negations: essays in critical theory*. Boston: Beacon Press.
- Mey, J. (1985). *Whose language?: a study in linguistic pragmatics*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Müller-Jacquier, B. (2001). Intercultural training. In Byram, M. (ed.) *The Routledge encyclopedia of language teaching and learning*. London: Routledge, pp. 300-3.
- Niranjana, T. (1991). Translation, colonialism and the rise of English. In Joshi, S. (ed.) *Rethinking English: essays in literature, language, history*. New Delhi, India: Trianka, pp. 124-45.
- Phillipson, R. (1992). *Linguistic imperialism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Pierce, B. N. (1995). Social identity, investment, and language learning. *TESOL Quarterly* 29: 9-32.
- Sayer, A. (in press) *Social science and normativity*.
- Shohamy, E. (1996). Performance assessment in language testing. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics* 15: 188-211.
- Shohamy, E. (2001). *The power of tests: a critical perspective on the uses of language tests*. London: Longman.
- Siegel, M. and Fernandez, S. L. (2000). Critical approaches. In Kamil, M. L., Mosenthal, P. B., Pearson, P. D. and Barr, R. (eds.) *Handbook of reading research, volume 3*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum, pp. 141-51.
- Simpson, J. A. and Weiner, E. S. C. (eds.) (1989). *The Oxford English dictionary, volume 4* (2nd edn.). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Sinclair, S. (ed.) (2002). *Collins COBUILD new student's dictionary*. London: Harper Collins.
- Skutnabb-Kangas, T. (1998). Human rights and language wrongs: a future for diversity? *Language Sciences* 20: 5-28.
- van Dijk, T. A. (2001). Multidisciplinary CDA: A plea for diversity. In Wodak, R. and Meyer, M. (eds.) *Methods of critical discourse analysis*. London: Sage, pp. 95-120.
- Venuti, L. (1997). *The scandals of translation: towards an ethics of difference*. London: Longman.
- Wallace, C. (1992). *Reading*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

- Walter, E. (ed.) (2005). *Cambridge advance learner's dictionary* (2nd edn.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Welsh, C. (1991). *Pedagogy and the struggle for voice: issues of language, power, and schooling for Puerto Ricans*. Toronto: OISE Press.
- Widdowson, H. G. (1995). Discourse analysis: A critical view. *Language and Literature* 4: 157-72.
- Widdowson, H. G. (1996). Reply to Fairclough: Discourse and interpretation: conjectures and refutations. *Language and Literature* 5: 57-69.
- Widdowson, H. G. (2001). Coming to terms with reality: applied linguistics in perspective. *AILA Review* 14: 2-17.
- Williams, E. (1998). Teaching reading. In Johnson, K. and Johoson, H. (eds.) (1998). *Encyclopedic dictionary of applied linguistics: a handbook for language teaching*. Oxford: Blackwell, pp. 330-5.
- Williams, R. (1976). *Keywords: a vocabulary of culture and society*. London: Fontana.
- Wodak, R. (1996). *Disorders of discourse*. London: Longman.
- Wodak, R. (2001a). What CDA is about - A summary of its history, important concepts and its development. In Wodak, R. and Meyer, M. (eds.) *Methods of critical discourse analysis*. London: Sage, pp. 1-13.
- Wodak, R. (2001b). The discourse-historical approach. In Wodak, R. and Meyer, M. (eds.) *Methods of critical discourse analysis*. London: Sage, pp. 63-94.
- Wodak, R. (2004). Critical Discourse Analysis - Theory and methodology. In Seale, C., Gobo, C., Gubrium, J. F. and Silverman, D. (eds.) *Qualitative research practice*. London: Sage, pp. 197-213.
- Wodak, R. (2007a). Pragmatics and critical discourse analysis: A cross-disciplinary inquiry. *Pragmatics & Cognition* 15: 203-25.
- Wodak, R. (2007b). *(Critical) Discourse Analysis: introducing relevant concepts and notions*. Material distributed at LING 440: Critical Discourse Analysis 2006/2007, Lancaster University.
- Wodak, R. and van Dijk, T. A. (eds.) (2000). *Racism at the top: parliamentary discourses on ethnic issues in six European states*. Klagenfurt, Austria: Drava.
- Wolin, R. (1992). *The terms of cultural criticism: the Frankfurt School, existentialism, poststructuralism*. New York: Columbia University Press.